

umes. Unfortunately it appears that there was no longer room for the synoptic table, which perhaps should have remained. Perhaps the most glaring deletion is the absence of 44 color maps and 320 black and white illustrations. It would have been worth expanding the set into four volumes to retain this table along with the maps and illustrations. Personally, I will have to keep both sets in my library.

As someone who teaches the history of Christianity, including es on early Christianity, this is a major reference work that every theological or research library should own. At the same time librarians should be careful not to discard the previous edition too quickly as it still will serve a useful purpose.

Michael W. Campbell

Adventist International Institute of Advanced Studies, PHILIPPINES

---

*The Lord's Watchman: A Life of Edward Irving (1792-1834)*, by Tim Grass. Eugene, OR: Pickwick, 2012. xv pp. + 303 pp. + 11 pp. appendix + 34 pp. bibliography + 8 pp. index. ISBN 978-1-8422-7426-2. Softcover US\$25.00.

This volume is the first major biography of Edward Irving in three decades as part of a lifelong interest by Tim Grass about Edward Irving, a controversial Scottish preacher. The title "The Lord's Watchman" is a biblical reference to Ezekiel 33, a text that Irving felt aptly depicted his life. Irving is convinced that the Lord called him to warn the church of danger.

Chapters one to three (pp. 1-15) describe Edward Irving's family background, early life, personal spiritual background, formative years, and education. As an Arts student, Irving desired to become a minister. He earned his degree in the Arts in 1809 at Edinburgh, but never gave up the dream of becoming a minister so he took up religious studies while working part time.

Chapters four to six (pp. 16-50) record Irving's work experience. First, Irving taught at Haddington and tutored Jane Welsh, a figure who later was an important link later on his life. While waiting for a call to the ministry he served as a school teacher in Kirkcaldy from 1812 to 1818. A particular highlight from this stage of his life was an encounter with Thomas Carlyle, a teacher at a rival school who in turn became one of his closest friends. During his time in Kirkcaldy, he befriended John Martin, an evangelical minister, whose daughter Isabella later became his wife.

Irving left Kirkcaldy for Edinburgh to improve his prospects for a call to the ministry. Occasionally he was invited to preach at various churches,

but still no call came. He became deeply discouraged. The author proposes (pp. 27-29) that his unpopularity may have brought his rejection by the patronage church system, and increased his negativity of contemporary preaching in the Church of Scotland. He embarked on a journey as a foreign missionary. As prepared to leave the port in Glasgow, he received a probationary call to serve as an assistant of the renowned preacher, Dr. Chalmers of St. John Church Parish Church in Glasgow. This gave him an outlet to share lectures from the Scriptures. His greatest success, though, was through pastoral visitation.

Chapters six to eight (pp. 40-80) deal with Irving's ministry in London. At long last the awaited call came for Irving to preach at the Caledonian Chapel. By this time Irving had earned his own reputation as a pulpiteer. Before formally reporting to London for the task, he returned home in Annan to be ordained. He next conducted the Eucharist sacrament service and preached a farewell sermon at St. John's Parish Church, which became his first published work.

Grass stressed that it was at London, at the Calendonian Chapel, where Irving gained meteoric popularity. His admirers included various dignitaries who listened to him preach. Tickets were sold in advance just to get a seat. Attendance soared from fifty to fifteen-hundred. A new church was built at Regent Square where Irving and his church members moved in order to accommodate the crowds.

Grass argues that Irving's preaching is a neglected aspect of his theology (p. 61). His topics were well-balanced, wide-ranging, and most importantly, his preaching style and pulpit manners stand out as unique for his time. He addressed social issues. His "pointed nature of the application" simply could not be ignored. While some praised his manners in the pulpit, others ridiculed him as "theatrical." Some admired his ability to quote from Shakespeare, while others condemned such references. Still yet other listeners discovered that his sermons appealed to their intellect while others dismissed his sermons as not "doctrinal or spiritual" enough. Regardless of the criticism, Irving attracted large audiences due to his distinctive preaching.

Chapters nine to thirteen (pp. 81-173) deal with Irving's family, personal life, work as a pastor, and his passion for Bible prophecy. Irving married his student Isabella Martin, although he continued to have a close relationship with Jane Welsh who became the wife of his friend Carlyle. Irving received numerous visitors, but he was a family man who managed to take care of his children. Three specific friends, who influenced his later beliefs, stand out from this period of his life: Coleridge, Frere, and Drummond.

As a pastor Irving was unconventional. His sermons often lasted over three hours. He focused increasingly on charismatic ideas and Bible

prophecy, which Grass speculates may have contributed to the decline in his audience (p. 155). Grass furthermore mentions that at this point Irving started to develop his views on the office of "angel," which he took as a reference to the work of a minister. The tone of his preaching at this time took on a much more nationalist flavor. He considered the Scots as part of God's covenant people. He calls for government leaders to be true to God by leading the people well. He condemned government leaders for giving Roman Catholics, whom he equated with the anti-Christ, more freedom (p. 144).

Grass describes Irving as a passionate student of prophecy (pp. 148-150). This was not unusual in light of the political climate of the era. Irving was pessimistic about the future as well as the condition of the church. He therefore became very critical of the ministry of different Missionary Societies who in turn depended on the financial support of their benefactors.

Chapters fourteen to eighteen (pp. 174-263) highlight Irving's controversial views. Although recent writers, like David W. Dorries and Colin E. Gunton, have become increasingly sympathetic with his views, during his lifetime, Irving, was charged as a heretic due in large part to his Christological views about the human nature of Christ. Grass did not offer a thorough discussion of all theological aspects and ramifications of this controversy. Irving, however, insisted that during the incarnation Christ took on a sinful human nature with all propensities to sin. In other words, Christ's human nature has no difference whatsoever with fallen humanity. For him this is the only way in which God could overthrow Satan who reigned in humanity's fallen nature. This is the only way for Christ to redeem fallen humanity. On the other hand, Irving was clear that Christ was perfectly sinless despite having a sinful human nature through the indwelling power of the Holy Spirit. In this way church members could be victorious over sin through the baptism of the Holy Spirit. Looking into Irving's argument, it seems that he underestimated the corruption of fallen human nature. Moreover, he appears to confine sin into outward action. In fallen human nature, temptation comes from within and sin is not limited to action, but rather, includes the state wherein fallen humanity is unable to extricate itself without the divine aid of a sinless atonement maker which is Jesus Christ.

A major shift in Edward's thinking occurred during his preaching tour to Scotland in 1828 which focused on eschatology. The meetings were well attended, but Dr. Chalmers criticized his lectures as full of "mysticism and extreme allegorization" (p. 193). This section describes the manifestations of the "Holy Spirit" in Scotland through a certain Mary Campbell who eventually moved to Irving's church in London. Irving believed that the charismatic gifts would be soon restored to the church once the church

was ready. This view was not widely received by the trustees and members of his church at Regent Square and created dissension. Moreover, some who professed to speak in tongues later recanted that they faked the phenomenon. This and other controversial views lead to his dismissal from Regent Square.

Chapters nineteen and twenty (pp. 264-288) tell how Irving and his supporters rented a humble place at Grey's Inn Road as a meeting place, which also served as a bazaar on other days. Together they preached in public places such as street corners and markets. Later the group founded a place at 14 Newman Street in London that served as a place of worship. The group developed a new system of church order later called "The Catholic Apostolic Church" wherein an apostle served as the supreme leader, in the person of J. B. Cardale, a leader from Irving's congregation. Grass suggests by quoting Gordon Strachan that Cardale attained this office through manipulation (p. 267). Proceedings at the time were already underway in Scotland to try Irving for his controversial views. Ultimately Irving was defrocked as a pastor in the Church of Scotland.

Irving continued to Scotland for preaching tours. Upon his return from Scotland to London, Grass records the painful episode of how he was prevented from officiating a child dedication service. Several reasons were given, most notably the fact that his ordination was revoked preventing him from officiating certain ecclesiastical functions. Thus for Irving, in this "new order" he served as an angel. Yet it is also evident that in this new role he was subject to the apostles of the church. Grass mentions that he was not without complaints from church members at Newman Street (p. 287). Unfortunately by this time Irving's health declined even as he continued his preaching work and travels.

The final two chapters describe the last days of Irving. Various opinions exist about why Irving travelled to Scotland, in spite of his frail health. One thing is certain is that Irving appeared to be convinced that his illness was a form of divine punishment for the sin of his church. He was optimistic that he would be restored to health, but he eventually succumbed to death. Both supporters and detractors paid tribute to Irving all the same despite his controversial views. Grass stresses Irving's role not simply as the founder of the Catholic Apostolic Church, but also as a catalyst for other Charismatic groups. In this sense Grass contributes to a new dimension of Irving historiography about his life and thought that reflects the explosive growth of Pentecostalism in the past century.

Altogether this volume builds on previous Irving biographies, offers a new and rich insights, and provides the most comprehensive overview of his life and thought to date. Some gaps missed by previous biographies are filled in this biography, especially his relationship with Jane Welsh (pp. 81-84), and the power struggle in the new system of church leader-

ship at the Catholic Apostolic Church (pp. 264-281). As a researcher of Irving's thought, I found the chronology of his life (pp. 305-308) especially helpful, as well as the list of his writings (pp. 309-313) as a useful tool that future researchers will no doubt find as a valuable starting point for Irving studies.

Remwil Tornalejo

Adventist International Institute of Advanced Studies, PHILIPPINES

---

*The Quest for the Trinity: The Doctrine of God in Scripture, History, and Modernity*, by Stephen R. Holmes. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2012. xx pp. + 200 pp. + 21 pp. bibliography + 2 pp. index of biblical texts + 1 p. index of technical terms + 7 pp. general index. ISBN 978-0-8308-3986-5. Softcover, US\$26.00.

In his work, Stephen Holmes, senior lecturer in systematic theology at the University of St. Andrews, Scotland, masterfully synthesizes two disciplines—historical and systematic theology. This book focuses on the Trinity doctrine in both the modern and patristic periods. The author notes the explosion of Trinitarian theology since the second half of the twentieth century, and states his thesis that the outcome of this Trinitarian renewal depend largely on concepts and ideas that are not present in either the patristic, medieval, or Reformation periods. The primary approach used by Holmes is the historical. He shows how modern authors differ from the classical formulation of the doctrine of Trinity. Holmes warns readers that he leans toward the classical understanding of this doctrine, since he rejects the idea that mainstream Christianity could be wrong with regard to its understanding about God's being. Moreover, according to Holmes, the twentieth-century Trinitarian revival "misunderstands and distorts the traditional doctrine so badly that it is unrecognizable" (p. xvi).

Holmes divides his work into three main sections. He begins with a study of the development of the doctrine of the Trinity in the twenty-first century. He analyzes the theological understanding of this doctrine in Karl Barth, Karl Rahner, John Zizioulas, Wolfhart Pannenberg, Jürgen Moltmann, Robert Jenson, Leonardo Boff, and Miroslav Volf—together with a quick look at some representatives of analytic philosophy of religion such as Cornelius Plantinga, Brian Leftow, and Michael Rea. Holmes notes a pattern among all these theologians, which includes an emphasis on the personal nature of God, the tendency to interpret univocally the language that is applied to God and the creatures, and the readiness to